



Marc Hirschmann

*Accretion and retention of bio-essential elements  
during Earth's catastrophic early history*

1  
00:00:19,070 --> 00:00:17,060  
I want to thank the organizers for the

2  
00:00:21,220 --> 00:00:19,080  
invitation to present these

3  
00:00:23,150 --> 00:00:21,230  
interdisciplinary conferences are always

4  
00:00:24,650 --> 00:00:23,160  
fascinating and I always learn a lot I

5  
00:00:26,599 --> 00:00:24,660  
didn't realize when I accepted the

6  
00:00:28,759 --> 00:00:26,609  
invitation just how much of the audience

7  
00:00:31,009 --> 00:00:28,769  
would actually be biologists as opposed

8  
00:00:33,200 --> 00:00:31,019  
to earth scientists and I've tried to

9  
00:00:34,910 --> 00:00:33,210  
make my talk as general as possible but

10  
00:00:36,319 --> 00:00:34,920  
it's 11 gives these sorts of talks to

11  
00:00:39,729 --> 00:00:36,329  
these sorts of audiences that one

12  
00:00:41,840 --> 00:00:39,739  
realizes the assumptions that are

13  
00:00:43,970 --> 00:00:41,850

present in one's field that one doesn't

14

00:00:46,040 --> 00:00:43,980

always know that the rest of the world

15

00:00:51,889 --> 00:00:46,050

doesn't know about so hopefully I will

16

00:00:56,150 --> 00:00:51,899

be able to overcome that that barrier so

17

00:00:58,700 --> 00:00:56,160

the point of today's talk or is in part

18

00:01:01,189 --> 00:00:58,710

that our planet has fortunately of

19

00:01:03,979 --> 00:01:01,199

course a sufficient amount of bio

20

00:01:05,960 --> 00:01:03,989

essential elements but it is interesting

21

00:01:07,670 --> 00:01:05,970

and probably not coincidental that the

22

00:01:09,260 --> 00:01:07,680

bio essential elements are also those

23

00:01:11,060 --> 00:01:09,270

elements that are essential for

24

00:01:14,000 --> 00:01:11,070

habitability and in fact really

25

00:01:17,240 --> 00:01:14,010

habitability is probably more germane to

26  
00:01:19,609 --> 00:01:17,250  
what we're going to be talking about or

27  
00:01:21,620 --> 00:01:19,619  
what I'm going to be talking about the

28  
00:01:23,210 --> 00:01:21,630  
most of the talk is actually going to be

29  
00:01:24,380 --> 00:01:23,220  
about carbon and nitrogen with a little

30  
00:01:25,969 --> 00:01:24,390  
bit of hydrogen I'm welcome to say

31  
00:01:27,920 --> 00:01:25,979  
essentially nothing about sulfur and

32  
00:01:29,480 --> 00:01:27,930  
phosphorus but almost everything that I

33  
00:01:32,450 --> 00:01:29,490  
say applies to all of these elements

34  
00:01:35,090 --> 00:01:32,460  
which is to say that the presence of

35  
00:01:37,219 --> 00:01:35,100  
these elements on the planet is a

36  
00:01:39,740 --> 00:01:37,229  
product actually not of accretion really

37  
00:01:41,390 --> 00:01:39,750  
but of a depletion right the amount of

38  
00:01:42,920 --> 00:01:41,400

material that was available in the solar

39

00:01:45,080 --> 00:01:42,930

system of all these elements was far

40

00:01:47,179 --> 00:01:45,090

greater than actually we have on the

41

00:01:50,749 --> 00:01:47,189

surface and it's the fact that the

42

00:01:53,300 --> 00:01:50,759

planet managed to save a little bit over

43

00:01:58,700 --> 00:01:53,310

the course of those that depletion that

44

00:02:00,770 --> 00:01:58,710

we have a habitable planet so we this is

45

00:02:02,959 --> 00:02:00,780

of course the blue planet and everybody

46

00:02:04,940 --> 00:02:02,969

looks at it and probably those of you

47

00:02:06,499 --> 00:02:04,950

who live on the surface think that

48

00:02:08,589 --> 00:02:06,509

there's a great deal of water in fact

49

00:02:11,270 --> 00:02:08,599

the earth has very little water

50

00:02:13,430 --> 00:02:11,280

two-thirds of the surface of the of the

51  
00:02:13,880 --> 00:02:13,440  
planet is covered by water but if you

52  
00:02:15,350 --> 00:02:13,890  
average

53  
00:02:19,190 --> 00:02:15,360  
it over the mass of the planet it's

54  
00:02:21,650 --> 00:02:19,200  
about 300 parts per million the for the

55  
00:02:24,199 --> 00:02:21,660  
most part this is a very very dry object

56  
00:02:26,270 --> 00:02:24,209  
but not totally dry if it were totally

57  
00:02:27,770 --> 00:02:26,280  
dry of course then we would be mercury

58  
00:02:28,970 --> 00:02:27,780  
or the moon or something like that and

59  
00:02:32,780 --> 00:02:28,980  
we wouldn't be having these

60  
00:02:34,640 --> 00:02:32,790  
conversations we wouldn't be here this

61  
00:02:38,420 --> 00:02:34,650  
the same is true actually even more so

62  
00:02:41,300 --> 00:02:38,430  
for carbon and nitrogen the supply that

63  
00:02:43,550 --> 00:02:41,310

we have is sufficient but it is actually

64

00:02:45,640 --> 00:02:43,560

a very very small fraction of what was

65

00:02:50,240 --> 00:02:45,650

originally available in the solar system

66

00:02:52,250 --> 00:02:50,250

oops so this is a plot of the abundance

67

00:02:53,630 --> 00:02:52,260

of elements in the solar system or the

68

00:02:57,160 --> 00:02:53,640

abundance of the elements in the Sun

69

00:02:59,360 --> 00:02:57,170

it's essentially the same thing and

70

00:03:01,310 --> 00:02:59,370

normalized to the amount of silicon so

71

00:03:03,440 --> 00:03:01,320

10 to the 6th would be an equal amount

72

00:03:05,600 --> 00:03:03,450

of silicon and whatever element that's

73

00:03:08,449 --> 00:03:05,610

plotted here and it's of course a log

74

00:03:10,729 --> 00:03:08,459

scale and nitrogen isn't noted here but

75

00:03:12,170 --> 00:03:10,739

it's there the in fact the availability

76

00:03:15,080 --> 00:03:12,180

of the essential elements hydrogen

77

00:03:16,550 --> 00:03:15,090

carbon nitrogen oxygen in the solar

78

00:03:18,770 --> 00:03:16,560

system is far greater than that of

79

00:03:22,100 --> 00:03:18,780

silicon there's more of that stuff than

80

00:03:23,449 --> 00:03:22,110

there is rock if our planet was made of

81

00:03:27,410 --> 00:03:23,459

that then we would be something like

82

00:03:30,020 --> 00:03:27,420

Jupiter or or or or a star and we

83

00:03:32,990 --> 00:03:30,030

wouldn't have a habitable terrestrial

84

00:03:35,600 --> 00:03:33,000

planet so the initial availability is

85

00:03:36,949 --> 00:03:35,610

not the problem in fact it's going to or

86

00:03:38,780 --> 00:03:36,959

we're going to see that it's going to be

87

00:03:40,789 --> 00:03:38,790

the opposite the process of planet

88

00:03:44,930 --> 00:03:40,799

formation is a process of loss of these

89  
00:03:46,610 --> 00:03:44,940  
elements and saving just enough now what

90  
00:03:48,289 --> 00:03:46,620  
the problem of course is is I don't

91  
00:03:51,740 --> 00:03:48,299  
really know what just enough is and I

92  
00:03:53,660 --> 00:03:51,750  
maybe some of you do but it's clearly

93  
00:03:55,819 --> 00:03:53,670  
something similar to what we have within

94  
00:03:59,240 --> 00:03:55,829  
a couple orders of magnitude right Earth

95  
00:04:01,280 --> 00:03:59,250  
has just enough but what the band is too

96  
00:04:04,660 --> 00:04:01,290  
little or less than Earth or greater

97  
00:04:07,220 --> 00:04:04,670  
than Earth is I think an open question

98  
00:04:08,840 --> 00:04:07,230  
so here's another way of looking at this

99  
00:04:10,130 --> 00:04:08,850  
on a mug to use this slide again and

100  
00:04:12,620 --> 00:04:10,140  
again despite the fact that it's a

101

00:04:14,180 --> 00:04:12,630

little bit fuzzy so this is the

102

00:04:15,860 --> 00:04:14,190

abundance of carbon and this is the

103

00:04:18,199 --> 00:04:15,870

abundance of nitrogen relative to that

104

00:04:21,380 --> 00:04:18,209

of silicon in various solar system

105

00:04:23,570 --> 00:04:21,390

materials starting from the Sun or we

106

00:04:25,310 --> 00:04:23,580

could also look at beyond our solar

107

00:04:27,470 --> 00:04:25,320

system to the interstellar medium and

108

00:04:30,410 --> 00:04:27,480

see great abundances of carbon

109

00:04:32,630 --> 00:04:30,420

also nitrogen icy bodies

110

00:04:35,840 --> 00:04:32,640

undifferentiated bodies also have a

111

00:04:37,610 --> 00:04:35,850

great deal primitive building blocks of

112

00:04:39,830 --> 00:04:37,620

planets as represented by chondritic

113

00:04:41,570 --> 00:04:39,840

meteorites have certain proportions and

114

00:04:44,270 --> 00:04:41,580

then finally we get to earth and you'll

115

00:04:46,250 --> 00:04:44,280

notice that the scale on here is

116

00:04:48,620 --> 00:04:46,260

tremendous so if you want to think about

117

00:04:50,300 --> 00:04:48,630

it this way the earth has something like

118

00:04:52,880 --> 00:04:50,310

10 to the minus four of the original

119

00:04:54,950 --> 00:04:52,890

potential supply of carbon and about 10

120

00:04:57,770 --> 00:04:54,960

to the minus 5 of the original potential

121

00:04:59,990 --> 00:04:57,780

supply of nitrogen so the process of

122

00:05:02,300 --> 00:05:00,000

planet formation or actually first of

123

00:05:05,480 --> 00:05:02,310

all the process of rock formation going

124

00:05:07,340 --> 00:05:05,490

from dust and gas to Rakeem it simple

125

00:05:08,660 --> 00:05:07,350

rocky materials and then going from

126

00:05:11,090 --> 00:05:08,670

those simple rocky materials to

127

00:05:14,090 --> 00:05:11,100

assembling planets is a process of loss

128

00:05:16,580 --> 00:05:14,100

and the key of course is is that the

129

00:05:19,310 --> 00:05:16,590

planet of interest the one that becomes

130

00:05:21,320 --> 00:05:19,320

the habitable planet it is the one that

131

00:05:23,060 --> 00:05:21,330

loses just the right amount doesn't lose

132

00:05:24,860 --> 00:05:23,070

too much because if you can lose four

133

00:05:27,140 --> 00:05:24,870

orders of magnitude why can't you lose

134

00:05:28,430 --> 00:05:27,150

six orders of magnitude or seven orders

135

00:05:32,630 --> 00:05:28,440

of magnitude that's of course what

136

00:05:34,820 --> 00:05:32,640

mercury probably did and so the loss may

137

00:05:38,270 --> 00:05:34,830

must be just the right amount and each

138

00:05:40,670 --> 00:05:38,280

of these processes from going from going

139

00:05:44,210 --> 00:05:40,680

from gas and dust to rocks is a lost

140

00:05:46,730 --> 00:05:44,220

process in the early solar nebula and

141

00:05:48,910 --> 00:05:46,740

then going from rocks to planetary

142

00:05:53,750 --> 00:05:48,920

differentiation is a second stage of

143

00:05:55,040 --> 00:05:53,760

loss so one way to think about it it's

144

00:05:58,130 --> 00:05:55,050

actually a bit of a deceptive way to

145

00:05:59,990 --> 00:05:58,140

think about it is that that the

146

00:06:02,420 --> 00:06:00,000

habitability of our planet depends on

147

00:06:04,580 --> 00:06:02,430

the amount of co2 on our atmosphere and

148

00:06:07,010 --> 00:06:04,590

of course our location relative to the

149

00:06:08,840 --> 00:06:07,020

Sun and we see tremendous variability

150

00:06:13,880 --> 00:06:08,850

just amongst our nearest neighbors

151  
00:06:16,160 --> 00:06:13,890  
between Venus Earth and Mars and this is

152  
00:06:19,340 --> 00:06:16,170  
at least apparently on the surface too

153  
00:06:20,900 --> 00:06:19,350  
much right it it isn't necessarily so

154  
00:06:22,490 --> 00:06:20,910  
that Venus has too much carbon but

155  
00:06:24,950 --> 00:06:22,500  
certainly Venus has too much carbon on

156  
00:06:27,020 --> 00:06:24,960  
its surface to be habitable and Mars has

157  
00:06:28,880 --> 00:06:27,030  
too little for its place in the solar

158  
00:06:30,440 --> 00:06:28,890  
system to be habitable at the moment

159  
00:06:33,830 --> 00:06:30,450  
although that may not have been true

160  
00:06:35,600 --> 00:06:33,840  
early in in solar system history one

161  
00:06:37,700 --> 00:06:35,610  
reason that this is deceptive is this is

162  
00:06:39,530 --> 00:06:37,710  
just a service inventory and in fact

163  
00:06:41,270 --> 00:06:39,540

it's not just the surface inventory

164

00:06:42,680 --> 00:06:41,280

that's important it's also the

165

00:06:47,180 --> 00:06:42,690

inventory in the interior of a

166

00:06:49,310 --> 00:06:47,190

terrestrial planet so another way to

167

00:06:51,350 --> 00:06:49,320

look at this this plot or if plot

168

00:06:53,930 --> 00:06:51,360

similar to this was shown yesterday the

169

00:06:56,210 --> 00:06:53,940

so-called habitable zone which depends

170

00:06:58,220 --> 00:06:56,220

of course on the on this stellar

171

00:07:00,950 --> 00:06:58,230

luminosity of the particular star and

172

00:07:03,490 --> 00:07:00,960

the location of the planet relative to

173

00:07:07,550 --> 00:07:03,500

the star and we have Venus Earth and

174

00:07:10,490 --> 00:07:07,560

Mars there this plot of habitability is

175

00:07:12,140 --> 00:07:10,500

is really dependent on some assumptions

176

00:07:15,350 --> 00:07:12,150

about the availability of a greenhouse

177

00:07:18,080 --> 00:07:15,360

gas right it for example this line here

178

00:07:20,900 --> 00:07:18,090

is defined by the maximum saturation of

179

00:07:24,170 --> 00:07:20,910

co2 something like 40 atmospheres of co2

180

00:07:25,970 --> 00:07:24,180

I think if i recall correctly but that

181

00:07:27,440 --> 00:07:25,980

assumes that 40 atmospheres of co2 are

182

00:07:29,390 --> 00:07:27,450

available to the planet which actually

183

00:07:31,610 --> 00:07:29,400

is a fair amount of carbon considering

184

00:07:33,140 --> 00:07:31,620

that we have these hierarchies of loss

185

00:07:35,870 --> 00:07:33,150

that we don't know how far they're going

186

00:07:38,409 --> 00:07:35,880

to go so it isn't just a question of the

187

00:07:40,940 --> 00:07:38,419

solar luminosity in the location within

188

00:07:43,040 --> 00:07:40,950

within the step within the particular

189

00:07:44,900 --> 00:07:43,050

solar system but also the availability

190

00:07:49,040 --> 00:07:44,910

or the retention you can think about it

191

00:07:52,040 --> 00:07:49,050

either way of the of the greenhouse

192

00:07:54,560 --> 00:07:52,050

gases that allow for this band of

193

00:08:03,230 --> 00:07:54,570

habitability which of course is created

194

00:08:07,210 --> 00:08:03,240

by greenhouse gases so starting here and

195

00:08:10,550 --> 00:08:07,220

going to hear I have plotted the Earth's

196

00:08:12,680 --> 00:08:10,560

BSE this is where the earth scientist

197

00:08:15,140 --> 00:08:12,690

has to explain to the biologists this is

198

00:08:16,640 --> 00:08:15,150

simple bulk silicate earth right it's

199

00:08:18,350 --> 00:08:16,650

basically all of the earth except for

200

00:08:20,659 --> 00:08:18,360

its metallic portion and I have a

201  
00:08:22,250 --> 00:08:20,669  
certain concentration here and if I were

202  
00:08:25,190 --> 00:08:22,260  
to take that surface inventory that I

203  
00:08:27,110 --> 00:08:25,200  
showed you before the 400 ppm co2 in the

204  
00:08:29,360 --> 00:08:27,120  
atmosphere it wouldn't be nearly that or

205  
00:08:31,219 --> 00:08:29,370  
the one bar or point eight bars of

206  
00:08:33,950 --> 00:08:31,229  
nitrogen it wouldn't be nearly that most

207  
00:08:35,899 --> 00:08:33,960  
of this BS e is actually in the interior

208  
00:08:39,820 --> 00:08:35,909  
most of the volatiles and the earth

209  
00:08:44,840 --> 00:08:43,250  
so the right amount one thing will

210  
00:08:46,579 --> 00:08:44,850  
return to this in a moment but the right

211  
00:08:49,730 --> 00:08:46,589  
amount is not just the surface reservoir

212  
00:08:51,230 --> 00:08:49,740  
it's the reservoir in the battery if you

213  
00:08:53,990 --> 00:08:51,240

will in the interior that replenishes

214

00:08:55,070 --> 00:08:54,000

the surface reservoir and also modulate

215

00:09:01,490 --> 00:08:55,080

the

216

00:09:06,320 --> 00:09:01,500

amount I don't know perhaps some of you

217

00:09:08,360 --> 00:09:06,330

do know it had better be the light

218

00:09:09,770 --> 00:09:08,370

amount earth must plot within the band

219

00:09:13,790 --> 00:09:09,780

of the right amount that's about all I

220

00:09:17,390 --> 00:09:13,800

dunno and of course it surely depends on

221

00:09:22,970 --> 00:09:17,400

things like radial distance and it is a

222

00:09:24,950 --> 00:09:22,980

product not of gain but of loss okay

223

00:09:26,390 --> 00:09:24,960

this plot comes again and again but I

224

00:09:31,550 --> 00:09:26,400

think I've already explained what i need

225

00:09:33,290 --> 00:09:31,560

to do for this particular whoops so yes

226

00:09:34,790 --> 00:09:33,300

alright so the point that I was

227

00:09:35,960 --> 00:09:34,800

beginning to make a moment ago that I'm

228

00:09:38,000 --> 00:09:35,970

going to return to is that this

229

00:09:41,000 --> 00:09:38,010

concentration here is not the

230

00:09:43,250 --> 00:09:41,010

concentration in the atmosphere or even

231

00:09:44,870 --> 00:09:43,260

on the surface but in the entire portion

232

00:09:48,920 --> 00:09:44,880

of the planet apart from that in the

233

00:09:51,890 --> 00:09:48,930

core there we go okay so just as an

234

00:09:53,750 --> 00:09:51,900

example for carbon and there are many

235

00:09:55,730 --> 00:09:53,760

different compilations like this I just

236

00:09:57,800 --> 00:09:55,740

happened to take this one because it's

237

00:09:59,990 --> 00:09:57,810

graphically interesting right the amount

238

00:10:01,880 --> 00:10:00,000

of carbon in the atmosphere is dwarfed

239

00:10:03,770 --> 00:10:01,890

by that which is in the oceans which is

240

00:10:06,740 --> 00:10:03,780

in turn dwarfed by that which is on the

241

00:10:10,340 --> 00:10:06,750

surface rocks such as lime stones and

242

00:10:12,050 --> 00:10:10,350

and so on which is in turn a small

243

00:10:16,400 --> 00:10:12,060

portion compared to that which is in the

244

00:10:19,610 --> 00:10:16,410

interior and what we find is first of

245

00:10:22,010 --> 00:10:19,620

all that um that that is that is this

246

00:10:23,470 --> 00:10:22,020

amount that the planet has and that that

247

00:10:26,840 --> 00:10:23,480

the planet apparently needs to operate

248

00:10:28,810 --> 00:10:26,850

and and and second of all that it's the

249

00:10:30,920 --> 00:10:28,820

exchanges between these which are

250

00:10:32,450 --> 00:10:30,930

intrinsically linked to plate tectonics

251

00:10:36,530 --> 00:10:32,460

which I think mark jelinek is going to

252

00:10:38,930 --> 00:10:36,540

talk about tomorrow that that allow for

253

00:10:40,580 --> 00:10:38,940

not just the beginning of a habitable

254

00:10:43,180 --> 00:10:40,590

planet but the steadiness of that

255

00:10:49,220 --> 00:10:43,190

habitable planet through various

256

00:10:54,720 --> 00:10:49,230

perturbations and in catastrophes so

257

00:10:58,199 --> 00:10:54,730

this whoops a little bit of

258

00:10:59,310 --> 00:10:58,209

slow there we go okay so this is for

259

00:11:01,290 --> 00:10:59,320

carbon I'm not going to show u

260

00:11:03,329 --> 00:11:01,300

equivalent maps for nitrogen and water

261

00:11:04,740 --> 00:11:03,339

but just a summary and actually we can

262

00:11:06,030 --> 00:11:04,750

skip the bottom portion of this plot

263

00:11:08,910 --> 00:11:06,040

just look at the top portion of this

264

00:11:12,240 --> 00:11:08,920

plot in fact for carbon water and

265

00:11:14,819 --> 00:11:12,250

nitrogen the reservoirs in the in the

266

00:11:16,620 --> 00:11:14,829

planet are not entirely on the surface

267

00:11:19,410 --> 00:11:16,630

its carbon that has the greatest amount

268

00:11:22,680 --> 00:11:19,420

of interior reservoir the amount of

269

00:11:24,569 --> 00:11:22,690

carbon in Earth's mantle is greatly

270

00:11:27,019 --> 00:11:24,579

exceeds that on the surface whereas

271

00:11:33,600 --> 00:11:27,029

those for water and nitrogen are

272

00:11:35,810 --> 00:11:33,610

approximately comparable | this is an

273

00:11:38,009 --> 00:11:35,820

example of something that you probably

274

00:11:40,740 --> 00:11:38,019

don't want me to step through in great

275

00:11:42,689 --> 00:11:40,750

detail the reason that i have this is

276

00:11:44,250 --> 00:11:42,699

that you may wonder how it is that we

277

00:11:45,930 --> 00:11:44,260

know what the concentrations of these

278

00:11:47,550 --> 00:11:45,940

elements are in the interior and the

279

00:11:49,170 --> 00:11:47,560

reason that we think we know it is

280

00:11:51,000 --> 00:11:49,180

because we have samples of the interior

281

00:11:53,670 --> 00:11:51,010

that comes from erupted volcanic

282

00:11:57,120 --> 00:11:53,680

products the salts that have preserved

283

00:11:59,639 --> 00:11:57,130

in them undie gas samples of melt that

284

00:12:01,290 --> 00:11:59,649

was made in the interior and we can look

285

00:12:04,439 --> 00:12:01,300

at the concentrations of things like

286

00:12:06,980 --> 00:12:04,449

carbon or water in these melts we can

287

00:12:10,710 --> 00:12:06,990

ratio them to trace elements such as

288

00:12:12,449 --> 00:12:10,720

barium niobium cerium and so on which we

289

00:12:13,949 --> 00:12:12,459

know very well the concentration of

290

00:12:15,629 --> 00:12:13,959

these in the earth because they're very

291

00:12:17,790 --> 00:12:15,639

steady their refractory lyssa file

292

00:12:19,860 --> 00:12:17,800

elements that are very very little

293

00:12:22,309 --> 00:12:19,870

between planetary objects and meteorites

294

00:12:25,620 --> 00:12:22,319

and so forth and from these ratios of

295

00:12:28,860 --> 00:12:25,630

carbon deberia more or water to cerium

296

00:12:31,139 --> 00:12:28,870

we can infer from these undie gas

297

00:12:35,819 --> 00:12:31,149

inclusions what the concentrations are

298

00:12:37,650 --> 00:12:35,829

in the interior and the reason that it's

299

00:12:40,230 --> 00:12:37,660

important or one of the reasons that

300

00:12:43,400 --> 00:12:40,240

it's important is not only are the these

301  
00:12:46,019 --> 00:12:43,410  
elements important for maintaining the

302  
00:12:47,790 --> 00:12:46,029  
our climate and and the atmosphere and

303  
00:12:52,199 --> 00:12:47,800  
so forth but they're also important for

304  
00:12:55,500 --> 00:12:52,209  
maintaining the dynamics of the interior

305  
00:12:59,040 --> 00:12:55,510  
so on the left here we have two

306  
00:13:00,930 --> 00:12:59,050  
different geodynamic models of how the

307  
00:13:02,639 --> 00:13:00,940  
strength of the lithosphere is affected

308  
00:13:04,559 --> 00:13:02,649  
either in the case where there's no

309  
00:13:06,900 --> 00:13:04,569  
water in the interior or in the cases

310  
00:13:07,560 --> 00:13:06,910  
where there is water in the material

311  
00:13:09,690 --> 00:13:07,570  
water

312  
00:13:11,700 --> 00:13:09,700  
greatly weakens rocks that allow strain

313  
00:13:13,860 --> 00:13:11,710

localization it allows for the

314

00:13:16,620 --> 00:13:13,870

lithosphere the strong outer layer of

315

00:13:20,730 --> 00:13:16,630

the earth to break and that breakage is

316

00:13:24,150 --> 00:13:20,740

in fact the allowing plate tectonics to

317

00:13:25,680 --> 00:13:24,160

occur so without some amounts of

318

00:13:27,090 --> 00:13:25,690

volatile zin the interior we don't have

319

00:13:30,510 --> 00:13:27,100

plate tectonics and we don't have the

320

00:13:32,810 --> 00:13:30,520

recycling mechanisms that that allow for

321

00:13:35,640 --> 00:13:32,820

the planet to maintain its steady

322

00:13:37,470 --> 00:13:35,650

interior and exterior dynamics actually

323

00:13:39,830 --> 00:13:37,480

these two plots that make the same point

324

00:13:42,210 --> 00:13:39,840

so I don't really relate with them a

325

00:13:43,890 --> 00:13:42,220

really great example of why this is

326

00:13:46,560 --> 00:13:43,900

important is every once in a while of

327

00:13:49,170 --> 00:13:46,570

course the in the history of a planet

328

00:13:52,050 --> 00:13:49,180

there is a tendency for the climate to

329

00:13:53,910 --> 00:13:52,060

go haywire the most extreme examples of

330

00:13:56,760 --> 00:13:53,920

these are the so-called snowball earth

331

00:13:58,920 --> 00:13:56,770

events which happened twice in the

332

00:14:02,580 --> 00:13:58,930

Precambrian or at least twice in the

333

00:14:04,080 --> 00:14:02,590

Precambrian where the where the where

334

00:14:07,110 --> 00:14:04,090

the climate ran away and became

335

00:14:08,880 --> 00:14:07,120

effectively sealed off and the way that

336

00:14:11,520 --> 00:14:08,890

the planet escaped the snowball earth

337

00:14:13,260 --> 00:14:11,530

was the fact that even though weathering

338

00:14:16,140 --> 00:14:13,270

reactions shut down and all sorts of

339

00:14:17,640 --> 00:14:16,150

other reactions shut down so that so

340

00:14:19,200 --> 00:14:17,650

that the plan seemingly became

341

00:14:21,860 --> 00:14:19,210

permanently called the continued

342

00:14:24,780 --> 00:14:21,870

outgassing of co2 from the interior

343

00:14:26,970 --> 00:14:24,790

renewed the greenhouse and and and

344

00:14:29,970 --> 00:14:26,980

brought the earth out of the snowball

345

00:14:32,190 --> 00:14:29,980

event so in effect the interior

346

00:14:35,310 --> 00:14:32,200

volatiles allow for dynamics that

347

00:14:38,340 --> 00:14:35,320

recycle nutrients and so forth and they

348

00:14:41,790 --> 00:14:38,350

also serve as a battery to maintain the

349

00:14:47,670 --> 00:14:41,800

steadiness or the reasonable steadiness

350

00:14:49,290 --> 00:14:47,680

of of the planet's climate so I again I

351  
00:14:51,630 --> 00:14:49,300  
think Mark jelinek is going to talk more

352  
00:14:53,780 --> 00:14:51,640  
about this tomorrow so I won't say too

353  
00:14:56,910 --> 00:14:53,790  
much more but all of these elements

354  
00:14:59,160 --> 00:14:56,920  
carbon hydrogen nitrogen sulfur

355  
00:15:00,990 --> 00:14:59,170  
phosphorus are cycling from the interior

356  
00:15:03,150 --> 00:15:01,000  
to the exterior if the essential

357  
00:15:06,270 --> 00:15:03,160  
nutrients are being renewed this way the

358  
00:15:09,450 --> 00:15:06,280  
climate is being held more or less

359  
00:15:11,640 --> 00:15:09,460  
steady this way and so these volatile

360  
00:15:16,830 --> 00:15:11,650  
cycles are crucial to the habitability

361  
00:15:20,970 --> 00:15:16,840  
of the planet okay so how did we get

362  
00:15:22,710 --> 00:15:20,980  
here we got here starting from here into

363  
00:15:24,569 --> 00:15:22,720

sets of processes one would be the

364

00:15:26,100 --> 00:15:24,579

formation of the rocks and then the

365

00:15:30,740 --> 00:15:26,110

other would be the formation from the

366

00:15:35,730 --> 00:15:30,750

rocks of the larger planetary bodies and

367

00:15:37,620 --> 00:15:35,740

so two essential kinds of primitive

368

00:15:39,960 --> 00:15:37,630

meteorites enstatite chondrites and

369

00:15:43,620 --> 00:15:39,970

carbonaceous chondrites illustrated here

370

00:15:48,240 --> 00:15:43,630

and here are our materials that been

371

00:15:50,400 --> 00:15:48,250

assembled from bits of dust and so on

372

00:15:51,689 --> 00:15:50,410

and the answer tight chondrites are

373

00:15:53,280 --> 00:15:51,699

generally thought to be inner solar

374

00:15:55,410 --> 00:15:53,290

system objects they're generally thought

375

00:15:57,600 --> 00:15:55,420

to be quite dry and volatile poor

376

00:16:00,240 --> 00:15:57,610

whereas the carbonaceous chondrites are

377

00:16:01,710 --> 00:16:00,250

thought to be outer not outer but middle

378

00:16:03,210 --> 00:16:01,720

solar system objects the outer solar

379

00:16:06,060 --> 00:16:03,220

system objects would be comments I

380

00:16:08,280 --> 00:16:06,070

suppose and the carbonaceous chondrites

381

00:16:10,319 --> 00:16:08,290

are thought to be rich in volatiles

382

00:16:11,850 --> 00:16:10,329

because they formed outside of the snow

383

00:16:13,860 --> 00:16:11,860

line where there were lots of Isis

384

00:16:15,300 --> 00:16:13,870

available to react with the rocks and

385

00:16:18,000 --> 00:16:15,310

the answer type chondrites are thought

386

00:16:19,439 --> 00:16:18,010

to be volatile depleted but if you look

387

00:16:21,420 --> 00:16:19,449

on this plot you'll see that the

388

00:16:23,610 --> 00:16:21,430

enstatite chondrites have orders of

389

00:16:26,100 --> 00:16:23,620

magnitude more carbon and nitrogen than

390

00:16:28,050 --> 00:16:26,110

that then our planet so it isn't just

391

00:16:30,030 --> 00:16:28,060

the rock formation in the interior of

392

00:16:31,769 --> 00:16:30,040

the solar system that depletes the

393

00:16:35,100 --> 00:16:31,779

system the process of planet formation

394

00:16:37,439 --> 00:16:35,110

is also a depletion process B op beyond

395

00:16:38,970 --> 00:16:37,449

this how is it that the answer type

396

00:16:40,379 --> 00:16:38,980

contracts have so much carbon and

397

00:16:43,650 --> 00:16:40,389

nitrogen when they formed in the inner

398

00:16:46,319 --> 00:16:43,660

solar system good question so here's a

399

00:16:49,139 --> 00:16:46,329

sort of a and I don't think we know the

400

00:16:52,920 --> 00:16:49,149

answer to it actually so here's sort of

401  
00:16:54,840 --> 00:16:52,930  
a map of broadly speaking in the outer

402  
00:16:56,670 --> 00:16:54,850  
solar system beyond the frost line where

403  
00:16:59,670 --> 00:16:56,680  
there are lots of Isis the carbonaceous

404  
00:17:03,900 --> 00:16:59,680  
chondrites and other icy bodies form and

405  
00:17:06,449 --> 00:17:03,910  
it is possible for rocks to react with

406  
00:17:08,939 --> 00:17:06,459  
water and carbon Isis and so forth and

407  
00:17:10,439 --> 00:17:08,949  
to gain volatiles that can later be

408  
00:17:12,240 --> 00:17:10,449  
delivered to the interior of the solar

409  
00:17:14,549 --> 00:17:12,250  
system but also here where it's supposed

410  
00:17:17,400 --> 00:17:14,559  
to be too hot too hot for Isis to form

411  
00:17:20,939 --> 00:17:17,410  
the enstatite chondrites gain carbon and

412  
00:17:23,970 --> 00:17:20,949  
nitrogen there are two answers to this

413  
00:17:26,039 --> 00:17:23,980

one well the two partial answers to this

414

00:17:28,409 --> 00:17:26,049

one is is that the carbon and nitrogen

415

00:17:30,240 --> 00:17:28,419

are actually probably not carried in

416

00:17:32,070 --> 00:17:30,250

Isis but they're probably carried in

417

00:17:34,320 --> 00:17:32,080

much more refractory materials

418

00:17:34,860 --> 00:17:34,330

refractory organics that form not by

419

00:17:39,120 --> 00:17:34,870

equilibria

420

00:17:42,750 --> 00:17:39,130

reactions but by by by various kinetic

421

00:17:44,970 --> 00:17:42,760

processes this plot just to focus on

422

00:17:47,490 --> 00:17:44,980

this plot here this is a kinetic model

423

00:17:48,990 --> 00:17:47,500

by Bergen at all a group that i'm

424

00:17:52,440 --> 00:17:49,000

involved with from the University of

425

00:17:54,450 --> 00:17:52,450

Michigan showing the amount of carbon as

426

00:17:56,040 --> 00:17:54,460

a function of radial distance that is

427

00:17:59,130 --> 00:17:56,050

actually contained within refractory

428

00:18:00,450 --> 00:17:59,140

carbon there are probably many such

429

00:18:04,799 --> 00:18:00,460

compounds but mostly in these

430

00:18:08,340 --> 00:18:04,809

calculations these are pahs and so first

431

00:18:09,960 --> 00:18:08,350

of all out here the temperatures of

432

00:18:11,490 --> 00:18:09,970

condensation temperatures of these

433

00:18:14,060 --> 00:18:11,500

refractory organics effectively are

434

00:18:16,590 --> 00:18:14,070

hundreds of degrees greater than that of

435

00:18:18,930 --> 00:18:16,600

water right so first of all they may

436

00:18:21,150 --> 00:18:18,940

form closer into the solar system and

437

00:18:23,730 --> 00:18:21,160

then second of all also radio mixing

438

00:18:25,650 --> 00:18:23,740

between interior and exterior or

439

00:18:27,600 --> 00:18:25,660

exterior and interior portions of the

440

00:18:31,980 --> 00:18:27,610

solar system may bring such materials

441

00:18:38,160 --> 00:18:31,990

into the inner solar system so that gets

442

00:18:40,169 --> 00:18:38,170

us more or less to to hear but also it's

443

00:18:43,350 --> 00:18:40,179

important I or I just mentioned radial

444

00:18:45,299 --> 00:18:43,360

mixing water is probably better studied

445

00:18:50,340 --> 00:18:45,309

than carbon and nitrogen we already know

446

00:18:52,049 --> 00:18:50,350

that if we posit that the early solar

447

00:18:56,700 --> 00:18:52,059

system consisted of essentially dry

448

00:18:58,830 --> 00:18:56,710

object in the interior and icy bodies in

449

00:19:00,960 --> 00:18:58,840

the exterior that just the dynamics of

450

00:19:05,190 --> 00:19:00,970

accretion lead to radial mixing which

451  
00:19:07,650 --> 00:19:05,200  
bring the fair portion of the icy bodies

452  
00:19:09,480 --> 00:19:07,660  
into the interior and so if one runs an

453  
00:19:12,299 --> 00:19:09,490  
accretion model such as this one ends up

454  
00:19:14,669 --> 00:19:12,309  
with planets that in the interior that

455  
00:19:16,620 --> 00:19:14,679  
have had delivered great amounts of

456  
00:19:18,120 --> 00:19:16,630  
water now notice by the way this is a

457  
00:19:19,860 --> 00:19:18,130  
log scale here you may not be able to

458  
00:19:21,840 --> 00:19:19,870  
read these numbers 10 to the minus 3 10

459  
00:19:24,840 --> 00:19:21,850  
to the minus 2 this sort of process

460  
00:19:27,750 --> 00:19:24,850  
leads to planets that are far more water

461  
00:19:31,620 --> 00:19:27,760  
rich by at least an order of magnitude

462  
00:19:34,260 --> 00:19:31,630  
then we actually observe in certainly an

463  
00:19:36,360 --> 00:19:34,270

earthen and obviously the other planets

464

00:19:38,580 --> 00:19:36,370

so there isn't any problem bringing the

465

00:19:40,140 --> 00:19:38,590

volatile in there were already what's it

466

00:19:42,060 --> 00:19:40,150

for carbon and nitrogen there wasn't the

467

00:19:43,320 --> 00:19:42,070

problems of all souls being there in the

468

00:19:44,880 --> 00:19:43,330

inner solar system in the first place

469

00:19:48,030 --> 00:19:44,890

because they're in the enstatite Condren

470

00:19:48,810 --> 00:19:48,040

so there is no problem in accreting all

471

00:19:53,659 --> 00:19:48,820

these material

472

00:19:56,820 --> 00:19:53,669

22 growing planets the the depletion is

473

00:19:59,159 --> 00:19:56,830

partial in that oh you know I'm okay for

474

00:20:01,620 --> 00:19:59,169

time still right the the depletion is

475

00:20:03,269 --> 00:20:01,630

partial in the formation of the rocks

476

00:20:05,970 --> 00:20:03,279

but a lot of the depletion actually has

477

00:20:09,120 --> 00:20:05,980

to take place in the stage of planet

478

00:20:13,049 --> 00:20:09,130

formation so that's where we're going to

479

00:20:14,249 --> 00:20:13,059

go from here to here one of the

480

00:20:17,279 --> 00:20:14,259

interesting things that was actually

481

00:20:19,019 --> 00:20:17,289

noted very prominently in a paper in the

482

00:20:21,499 --> 00:20:19,029

geochemical literature by bernard marty

483

00:20:25,919 --> 00:20:21,509

a few years ago is that this process of

484

00:20:28,379 --> 00:20:25,929

planet formation and and and delivery of

485

00:20:31,080 --> 00:20:28,389

volatiles not only delivers volatile in

486

00:20:33,450 --> 00:20:31,090

a depleted state but the depletion is

487

00:20:34,980 --> 00:20:33,460

differential that is to say that the

488

00:20:37,080 --> 00:20:34,990

amount of water that's delivered or

489

00:20:38,850 --> 00:20:37,090

maybe I shouldn't use delivered the

490

00:20:40,259 --> 00:20:38,860

amount of water that's retained the

491

00:20:41,669 --> 00:20:40,269

amount of carbon that's retained in the

492

00:20:43,889 --> 00:20:41,679

amount of nitrogen that's retained in

493

00:20:45,930 --> 00:20:43,899

the planet does not simply look like

494

00:20:47,730 --> 00:20:45,940

taking a carbonaceous chondrite are

495

00:20:50,909 --> 00:20:47,740

taking a building block and reducing

496

00:20:54,629 --> 00:20:50,919

amount it's it's volatile concentration

497

00:20:56,310 --> 00:20:54,639

some elements are depleted more more

498

00:20:59,190 --> 00:20:56,320

severely than others and in particular

499

00:21:01,080 --> 00:20:59,200

nitrogen is very strongly depleted

500

00:21:04,409 --> 00:21:01,090

interestingly it's even more depleted

501  
00:21:07,049 --> 00:21:04,419  
than a non reactive gases like neon or

502  
00:21:10,139 --> 00:21:07,059  
argon something that we have yet to

503  
00:21:12,779 --> 00:21:10,149  
explain whoops this rather complicated

504  
00:21:15,570 --> 00:21:12,789  
plot is basically the same information

505  
00:21:17,340 --> 00:21:15,580  
with just a lot more examples in it here

506  
00:21:19,710 --> 00:21:17,350  
is the bulk silicate earth in terms of

507  
00:21:23,240 --> 00:21:19,720  
its carbon nitrogen ratio here are all

508  
00:21:25,080 --> 00:21:23,250  
different kinds of primitive meteorites

509  
00:21:26,610 --> 00:21:25,090  
carbonaceous chondrites ordinary

510  
00:21:29,070 --> 00:21:26,620  
chondrite dennis too tight chondrites

511  
00:21:30,960 --> 00:21:29,080  
and there are a few exceptions but for

512  
00:21:32,759 --> 00:21:30,970  
the most end although it you'll notice

513  
00:21:34,289 --> 00:21:32,769

that some of these exceptions have to do

514

00:21:37,740 --> 00:21:34,299

with who's reporting it rather than what

515

00:21:41,159 --> 00:21:37,750

the objects are because the because of

516

00:21:42,899 --> 00:21:41,169

analytical challenges but almost all of

517

00:21:44,669 --> 00:21:42,909

the primitive objects have low carbon

518

00:21:45,869 --> 00:21:44,679

nitrogen ratio whereas the bulk silicate

519

00:21:47,820 --> 00:21:45,879

or if there's a high carbon nitrogen

520

00:21:50,430 --> 00:21:47,830

ratio so this is telling us something

521

00:21:51,869 --> 00:21:50,440

about the depletion process that is

522

00:21:53,070 --> 00:21:51,879

differential and that's and that

523

00:21:57,450 --> 00:21:53,080

different elements are going to behave

524

00:21:59,340 --> 00:21:57,460

differently so one of the great

525

00:22:01,760 --> 00:21:59,350

catastrophic events of course is blow

526

00:22:04,370 --> 00:22:01,770

off of the atmosphere by impacts

527

00:22:06,260 --> 00:22:04,380

small and large and we know this

528

00:22:08,360 --> 00:22:06,270

occurred the whole process of assembling

529

00:22:11,060 --> 00:22:08,370

a planet to the series of ever larger

530

00:22:15,590 --> 00:22:11,070

energy events perhaps culminating in the

531

00:22:18,220 --> 00:22:15,600

in the moon-forming impact that that was

532

00:22:20,450 --> 00:22:18,230

sufficient to melt the entire Earth and

533

00:22:22,580 --> 00:22:20,460

these impacts of course have the

534

00:22:24,800 --> 00:22:22,590

possibility the likelihood that they

535

00:22:27,020 --> 00:22:24,810

will blow off whatever primitive early

536

00:22:29,210 --> 00:22:27,030

atmosphere the planet has accreted and

537

00:22:31,100 --> 00:22:29,220

there's also the possibility that this

538

00:22:33,650 --> 00:22:31,110

can be differential for example again de

539

00:22:36,980 --> 00:22:33,660

a knob a ten years ago now 12 years ago

540

00:22:38,870 --> 00:22:36,990

pointed out that if there's a impact to

541

00:22:41,810 --> 00:22:38,880

a planet that already has a liquid water

542

00:22:43,460 --> 00:22:41,820

ocean and a co2 nitrogen atmosphere that

543

00:22:45,560 --> 00:22:43,470

that the atmosphere can be lost

544

00:22:48,680 --> 00:22:45,570

differentially to the ocean and that

545

00:22:50,510 --> 00:22:48,690

that may explain why a ratio that I

546

00:22:53,150 --> 00:22:50,520

haven't yet shown you but it's the same

547

00:22:57,530 --> 00:22:53,160

as before that that the carbon is lost

548

00:22:58,970 --> 00:22:57,540

preferentially to the water in in the

549

00:23:04,090 --> 00:22:58,980

bulk silicate ER it's as compared to

550

00:23:07,700 --> 00:23:04,100

it's likely building blocks the other

551  
00:23:10,000 --> 00:23:07,710  
catastrophic event is core formation so

552  
00:23:14,870 --> 00:23:10,010  
the atmospheric loss and core formation

553  
00:23:17,330 --> 00:23:14,880  
we knew 150 years ago in fact as soon as

554  
00:23:20,600 --> 00:23:17,340  
the advent of of industrial steel that

555  
00:23:22,400 --> 00:23:20,610  
that that iron metal loves all of the

556  
00:23:25,040 --> 00:23:22,410  
bio essential elements all of them

557  
00:23:28,670 --> 00:23:25,050  
carbon nitrogen hydrogen sulfur

558  
00:23:31,040 --> 00:23:28,680  
phosphorus if it were up to the metal it

559  
00:23:32,660 --> 00:23:31,050  
would steal all of the material that we

560  
00:23:34,460 --> 00:23:32,670  
have on the surface that that is bio

561  
00:23:37,010 --> 00:23:34,470  
essential and also that we need from

562  
00:23:39,670 --> 00:23:37,020  
habitability so core formation has the

563  
00:23:44,690 --> 00:23:39,680

possibility of robbing the surface of

564

00:23:50,600 --> 00:23:44,700

much most all of the bioavailable

565

00:23:54,020 --> 00:23:50,610

element quantifying this is actually for

566

00:23:56,120 --> 00:23:54,030

in geologically plausible conditions is

567

00:23:58,610 --> 00:23:56,130

actually a project that the community

568

00:23:59,990 --> 00:23:58,620

has taken on fairly recently we tend to

569

00:24:01,910 --> 00:24:00,000

think about this in terms of a very

570

00:24:04,040 --> 00:24:01,920

relatively simple parameter called the

571

00:24:05,780 --> 00:24:04,050

partition coefficient the D which is

572

00:24:08,420 --> 00:24:05,790

experimentally the concentration of

573

00:24:10,040 --> 00:24:08,430

carbon that is in the metal alloy as

574

00:24:12,200 --> 00:24:10,050

compared to the silicate that both

575

00:24:15,440 --> 00:24:12,210

ultimately going to form the mantle and

576

00:24:18,500 --> 00:24:15,450

D gas to form the surface reservoirs

577

00:24:21,230 --> 00:24:18,510

and values for carbon tend to be 10 to

578

00:24:23,299 --> 00:24:21,240

the 2 or greater the concentration of

579

00:24:25,370 --> 00:24:23,309

carbon in the metal is a hundred or a

580

00:24:28,360 --> 00:24:25,380

thousand or ten thousand times greater

581

00:24:30,860 --> 00:24:28,370

than that which is in the silicate and

582

00:24:32,360 --> 00:24:30,870

for nitrogen actually it varies as a

583

00:24:34,129 --> 00:24:32,370

function of I haven't told you what this

584

00:24:36,350 --> 00:24:34,139

parameter is on the x-axis but it's

585

00:24:39,230 --> 00:24:36,360

basically the oxidation state of the

586

00:24:41,600 --> 00:24:39,240

system from oxidized to reduced and

587

00:24:43,519 --> 00:24:41,610

nitrogens behavior depends on that but

588

00:24:46,370 --> 00:24:43,529

under most plausible conditions it to

589

00:24:51,710 --> 00:24:46,380

greatly concentrates in the alloy as

590

00:24:54,889 --> 00:24:51,720

compared to the silicate so core

591

00:24:57,620 --> 00:24:54,899

formation is going to take much of the

592

00:24:59,810 --> 00:24:57,630

carbon much of the nitrogen atmospheric

593

00:25:02,990 --> 00:24:59,820

loss is going to is going to

594

00:25:06,560 --> 00:25:03,000

quantitatively remove materials from the

595

00:25:09,019 --> 00:25:06,570

surface when it occurs and we can think

596

00:25:14,269 --> 00:25:09,029

about the formation of early reservoirs

597

00:25:18,680 --> 00:25:14,279

as a magma ocean losing metal to the

598

00:25:21,019 --> 00:25:18,690

interior and losing gas to the to this

599

00:25:22,700 --> 00:25:21,029

to the atmosphere which has the

600

00:25:26,289 --> 00:25:22,710

potential for loss the only thing that

601  
00:25:28,460 --> 00:25:26,299  
is likely to be retained over time

602  
00:25:33,799 --> 00:25:28,470  
available to the eventual surface is

603  
00:25:35,840 --> 00:25:33,809  
that which is in the silicate and so

604  
00:25:38,360 --> 00:25:35,850  
this is controlled by the solubility of

605  
00:25:41,570 --> 00:25:38,370  
the materials the solubility of carbon

606  
00:25:44,960 --> 00:25:41,580  
or or or support carbon monoxide or

607  
00:25:47,169 --> 00:25:44,970  
nitrogen or or or ammonia and the

608  
00:25:50,629 --> 00:25:47,179  
partitioning between the silicate and

609  
00:25:52,789 --> 00:25:50,639  
and the alloy and one can make a map for

610  
00:25:56,000 --> 00:25:52,799  
the different elements of their relative

611  
00:25:59,120 --> 00:25:56,010  
propensity to be either in the mantle or

612  
00:26:00,980 --> 00:25:59,130  
the atmosphere this mantle or the

613  
00:26:02,600 --> 00:26:00,990

atmosphere or the mantle or the core

614

00:26:05,060 --> 00:26:02,610

depending on these different parameters

615

00:26:07,610 --> 00:26:05,070

and what one finds is is that for

616

00:26:11,389 --> 00:26:07,620

example carbon loves to be in the core

617

00:26:13,490 --> 00:26:11,399

or the atmosphere it hardly stays in the

618

00:26:15,440 --> 00:26:13,500

silicate as well the other extreme would

619

00:26:18,830 --> 00:26:15,450

be water which has great solubility in

620

00:26:23,269 --> 00:26:18,840

the silicate another way to look at that

621

00:26:24,919 --> 00:26:23,279

is is this way where again the amount

622

00:26:27,350 --> 00:26:24,929

that's retained in the silicate portion

623

00:26:29,120 --> 00:26:27,360

of the earth is minimal for carbon and

624

00:26:32,830 --> 00:26:29,130

maximal for water and inter

625

00:26:34,910 --> 00:26:32,840

for nitrogen this is the differential

626  
00:26:38,990 --> 00:26:34,920  
retention that I was talking about

627  
00:26:40,310 --> 00:26:39,000  
before that we see evidence for I will

628  
00:26:44,210 --> 00:26:40,320  
skip this because the belt is already

629  
00:26:47,450 --> 00:26:44,220  
wrong however these processes are too

630  
00:26:48,920 --> 00:26:47,460  
potent I said that there is a loss

631  
00:26:52,910 --> 00:26:48,930  
process and in fact there is a loss

632  
00:26:55,850 --> 00:26:52,920  
process and this loss process if one

633  
00:26:58,160 --> 00:26:55,860  
allows it to occur with either with

634  
00:27:00,380 --> 00:26:58,170  
atmospheric loss or without atmospheric

635  
00:27:02,660 --> 00:27:00,390  
loss for even small amounts of metal

636  
00:27:04,910 --> 00:27:02,670  
transiting into the core one ends up

637  
00:27:07,450 --> 00:27:04,920  
with ratios of carbon nitrogen carbon

638  
00:27:10,640 --> 00:27:07,460

hydrogen and so forth starting from

639

00:27:12,470 --> 00:27:10,650

chondritic materials that are much more

640

00:27:18,140 --> 00:27:12,480

extreme than what we observe in the bulk

641

00:27:20,420 --> 00:27:18,150

silicate earth what's the solution to

642

00:27:22,010 --> 00:27:20,430

this the solution to this is something

643

00:27:24,280 --> 00:27:22,020

that was referred to yesterday and the

644

00:27:27,230 --> 00:27:24,290

discussions is the so-called late veneer

645

00:27:30,280 --> 00:27:27,240

after the catastrophic the largest

646

00:27:32,690 --> 00:27:30,290

catastrophic events of core formation

647

00:27:34,430 --> 00:27:32,700

atmospheric blow-off associated with the

648

00:27:36,860 --> 00:27:34,440

moon-forming impact and so forth of

649

00:27:38,510 --> 00:27:36,870

course accretion continued not nearly as

650

00:27:40,970 --> 00:27:38,520

much accretion but a small amount and

651  
00:27:47,740 --> 00:27:40,980  
that accretion added chondritic like

652  
00:27:52,850 --> 00:27:50,630  
we know this occurred accretion models

653  
00:27:59,590 --> 00:27:52,860  
of course can't possibly stop with the

654  
00:28:03,260 --> 00:27:59,600  
last final slide climatic of climactic

655  
00:28:07,520 --> 00:28:03,270  
climatic and climactic are it's tempting

656  
00:28:10,880 --> 00:28:07,530  
to say 111 means the other climactic

657  
00:28:14,630 --> 00:28:10,890  
events I and and so depending on when

658  
00:28:18,110 --> 00:28:14,640  
those last large impacts occurred we

659  
00:28:20,570 --> 00:28:18,120  
expect something like 10 to the minus 3

660  
00:28:22,970 --> 00:28:20,580  
10 to the minus 2 even as much as 10 to

661  
00:28:25,430 --> 00:28:22,980  
the minus one of the mass of the earth

662  
00:28:29,680 --> 00:28:25,440  
to continue to accrete we know that this

663  
00:28:31,970 --> 00:28:29,690

occurred according to the metals the

664

00:28:33,770 --> 00:28:31,980

metals that love to go into the course

665

00:28:34,970 --> 00:28:33,780

in rafal elements like platinum and so

666

00:28:37,190 --> 00:28:34,980

forth those of you who like precious

667

00:28:40,460 --> 00:28:37,200

metal jewelry would wish that our late

668

00:28:42,499 --> 00:28:40,470

veneer would have been greater and so

669

00:28:45,589 --> 00:28:42,509

some amount was added afterwards and

670

00:28:50,829 --> 00:28:45,599

some amount also added other sidra five

671

00:28:56,930 --> 00:28:53,869

however the fact that there is this

672

00:28:59,419 --> 00:28:56,940

differential concentration compared to

673

00:29:02,269 --> 00:28:59,429

late veneer like materials compared to

674

00:29:05,389 --> 00:29:02,279

meteoritic materials shows us that the

675

00:29:07,489 --> 00:29:05,399

sum of the of the bioavailable elements

676

00:29:10,099 --> 00:29:07,499

the sum of the habitable important

677

00:29:12,680 --> 00:29:10,109

elements is some combination between

678

00:29:15,619 --> 00:29:12,690

that material that was processed through

679

00:29:17,930 --> 00:29:15,629

the core forming and atmospheric loss

680

00:29:21,019 --> 00:29:17,940

processes and something added back we

681

00:29:23,539 --> 00:29:21,029

actually need both we need we need early

682

00:29:25,519 --> 00:29:23,549

delivery and processing in the in the in

683

00:29:27,529 --> 00:29:25,529

these catastrophes and then we need

684

00:29:30,439 --> 00:29:27,539

material added afterwards otherwise we

685

00:29:31,399 --> 00:29:30,449

would have to extreme barium first of

686

00:29:33,139 --> 00:29:31,409

all we wouldn't have enough of these

687

00:29:34,699 --> 00:29:33,149

elements and second of all the

688

00:29:40,369 --> 00:29:34,709

fractionation between them would be more

689

00:29:43,299 --> 00:29:40,379

extreme than what we observe okay so the

690

00:29:45,949 --> 00:29:43,309

one that is most extreme in terms of its

691

00:29:48,169 --> 00:29:45,959

magma ocean remnant is hydrogen there's

692

00:29:49,909 --> 00:29:48,179

much more hydrogen than there is the

693

00:29:52,399 --> 00:29:49,919

other elements and it's the one that's

694

00:29:54,859 --> 00:29:52,409

most soluble in the silicate so it's the

695

00:29:58,219 --> 00:29:54,869

one that's retained by the planet these

696

00:30:01,129 --> 00:29:58,229

probably carbon nitrogen sulfur were

697

00:30:03,829 --> 00:30:01,139

probably delivered after in small

698

00:30:06,919 --> 00:30:03,839

amounts after these catastrophic events

699

00:30:08,839 --> 00:30:06,929

whether or not this nitrogen depletion

700

00:30:11,239 --> 00:30:08,849

is owing to the fact that things were

701

00:30:13,489 --> 00:30:11,249

delivered that lost nitrogen in ways

702

00:30:15,680 --> 00:30:13,499

that we don't see in contradict

703

00:30:17,479 --> 00:30:15,690

meteorites is one possibility another

704

00:30:19,909 --> 00:30:17,489

possibility is that there was an

705

00:30:21,319 --> 00:30:19,919

additional process of late loss of a

706

00:30:28,539 --> 00:30:21,329

low-temperature atmosphere which would

707

00:30:33,439 --> 00:30:31,129

it isn't that we gained these elements

708

00:30:40,879 --> 00:30:33,449

it's that we lost them by just the right

709

00:30:43,459 --> 00:30:40,889

amount but the supply to hot inner solar

710

00:30:45,409 --> 00:30:43,469

system planets is is far greater than

711

00:30:47,059 --> 00:30:45,419

what we actually see in other words it

712

00:30:48,769 --> 00:30:47,069

isn't just that we were born in the

713

00:30:50,509 --> 00:30:48,779

inner solar system which was volatile

714

00:30:54,379 --> 00:30:50,519

depleted the process of planet formation

715

00:30:56,190 --> 00:30:54,389

expelled much much of the volatile and

716

00:30:58,200 --> 00:30:56,200

then the fractionation is

717

00:31:00,299 --> 00:30:58,210

is both core formation in atmospheric

718

00:31:02,100 --> 00:31:00,309

loss and the final inventory is a

719

00:31:03,779 --> 00:31:02,110

combination of early delivered elements

720

00:31:05,789 --> 00:31:03,789

in lace veneer and this isn't on the

721

00:31:08,310 --> 00:31:05,799

conclusion but i do want to return to

722

00:31:11,759 --> 00:31:08,320

the point that i made at the outset

723

00:31:13,830 --> 00:31:11,769

which is we would like to know what the

724

00:31:16,519 --> 00:31:13,840

right amount of these elements are in

725

00:31:19,639 --> 00:31:16,529

order to operate a planet that has

726

00:31:22,710 --> 00:31:19,649

steady internal dynamics and also steady

727

00:31:24,240 --> 00:31:22,720

habitable climate and apart from the

728

00:31:25,830 --> 00:31:24,250

fact that Earth is within the window i'm

729

00:31:40,440 --> 00:31:25,840

not sure we know what that window is

730

00:31:42,810 --> 00:31:40,450

thank you questions could you comment on

731

00:31:45,269 --> 00:31:42,820

to what extent should we be looking only

732

00:31:47,250 --> 00:31:45,279

at elements in its atomic form versus

733

00:31:49,470 --> 00:31:47,260

its molecular structures because often

734

00:31:51,690 --> 00:31:49,480

the fractionation seems to be dependent

735

00:31:53,879 --> 00:31:51,700

on the kind of molecules these carbon

736

00:31:57,269 --> 00:31:53,889

nitrogen oxygen sulfur phosphorus form

737

00:32:00,269 --> 00:31:57,279

in minerals how much of a dependence is

738

00:32:03,539 --> 00:32:00,279

it in terms of loss or depletion on a

739

00:32:05,159 --> 00:32:03,549

planet on yeah of course most of the

740

00:32:06,899 --> 00:32:05,169

processes that I'm talking about in

741

00:32:08,490 --> 00:32:06,909

terms of planet formation or very high

742

00:32:09,840 --> 00:32:08,500

temperature processing so all the

743

00:32:12,450 --> 00:32:09,850

molecules that would be thinking about

744

00:32:14,129 --> 00:32:12,460

are quite simple but depending on for

745

00:32:16,830 --> 00:32:14,139

example the oxidation state whether or

746

00:32:20,759 --> 00:32:16,840

not we have  $\text{N}_2$  or  $\text{NH}_3$  whether or not we

747

00:32:22,740 --> 00:32:20,769

have  $\text{CO}$  or  $\text{CO}_2$  or  $\text{CH}_4$  that's how simple we

748

00:32:25,259 --> 00:32:22,750

are in terms of the kinds of molecules

749

00:32:27,659 --> 00:32:25,269

that may be present the all of these

750

00:32:29,519 --> 00:32:27,669

parameters that are that I'm examining

751

00:32:31,409 --> 00:32:29,529

whether it be partitioning or solubility

752

00:32:33,180 --> 00:32:31,419

depend very strongly on that so that so

753

00:32:34,860 --> 00:32:33,190

that's quite important the only place

754

00:32:37,289 --> 00:32:34,870

where anything more complex may be

755

00:32:40,850 --> 00:32:37,299

involved would be in the other portion

756

00:32:43,889 --> 00:32:40,860

of the process going from dust grains to

757

00:32:45,720 --> 00:32:43,899

say chondritic meteorites are or their

758

00:32:49,769 --> 00:32:45,730

equivalent where the formation of

759

00:32:50,850 --> 00:32:49,779

various refractory organics will have a

760

00:32:53,070 --> 00:32:50,860

lot to do with their preservation

761

00:33:04,120 --> 00:32:53,080

through processes of metamorphism and

762

00:33:10,250 --> 00:33:07,550

yeah you mentioned that the bio

763

00:33:14,060 --> 00:33:10,260

essential elements are 0 files yes and

764

00:33:16,640 --> 00:33:14,070

then you like comparing bulk silicon

765

00:33:18,170 --> 00:33:16,650

earth but not bulk earth you then came

766

00:33:20,600 --> 00:33:18,180

to some conclusions about the late

767

00:33:23,600 --> 00:33:20,610

veneer but it seems to me that if you

768

00:33:28,550 --> 00:33:23,610

don't instead of using BSE you use BS

769

00:33:30,980 --> 00:33:28,560

bulk earth unpardonable yes if you had

770

00:33:33,320 --> 00:33:30,990

used be e then you could at least to the

771

00:33:34,910 --> 00:33:33,330

extent that we know about the how many

772

00:33:36,320 --> 00:33:34,920

of these essential elements are in the

773

00:33:39,590 --> 00:33:36,330

core i know that's not very well known

774

00:33:41,510 --> 00:33:39,600

but we know a little bit and if we if

775

00:33:43,280 --> 00:33:41,520

you included that in the analysis you

776

00:33:45,200 --> 00:33:43,290

could say something a little bit more

777

00:33:46,790 --> 00:33:45,210

constraining about the late veneer for

778

00:33:48,950 --> 00:33:46,800

example maybe there are so many of these

779

00:33:50,240 --> 00:33:48,960

these elements the bio essential element

780

00:33:51,530 --> 00:33:50,250

in the core that you wouldn't even need

781

00:33:56,060 --> 00:33:51,540

elite veneer to explain some of the

782

00:34:00,470 --> 00:33:56,070

anomalies you see perhaps the guiding

783

00:34:02,270 --> 00:34:00,480

assumption in what I was telling you is

784

00:34:04,280 --> 00:34:02,280

that once things go to the core they

785

00:34:06,620 --> 00:34:04,290

stay there which is to say that they're

786

00:34:08,210 --> 00:34:06,630

not any longer available to be sampled

787

00:34:10,520 --> 00:34:08,220

by the surface or the mantle and so

788

00:34:12,050 --> 00:34:10,530

forth we don't know what those values

789

00:34:13,909 --> 00:34:12,060

are very well so when we look at the

790

00:34:16,370 --> 00:34:13,919

bulk silicate earth what we're looking

791

00:34:18,860 --> 00:34:16,380

at is the mantle the and the surface and

792

00:34:20,659 --> 00:34:18,870

so forth the late veneer sort of by

793

00:34:23,240 --> 00:34:20,669

definition is that material which is

794

00:34:26,960 --> 00:34:23,250

added after the closure or the effective

795

00:34:29,480 --> 00:34:26,970

closure of exchange with the core so I

796

00:34:31,040 --> 00:34:29,490

don't know that knowing the bulk earth

797

00:34:33,200 --> 00:34:31,050

would tell us much about the late veneer

798

00:34:35,480 --> 00:34:33,210

it would tell us a lot about the feeding

799

00:34:37,720 --> 00:34:35,490

zone of the original materials that were

800

00:34:40,280 --> 00:34:37,730

added to the earth enstatite chondrites

801  
00:34:45,100 --> 00:34:40,290  
carbonaceous chondrites and so on and it

802  
00:34:48,470 --> 00:34:47,419  
something that I haven't quantified for

803  
00:34:50,390 --> 00:34:48,480  
you I've just told you that they're both

804  
00:34:52,070 --> 00:34:50,400  
important is that there's the processes

805  
00:34:55,040 --> 00:34:52,080  
of core formation and also atmospheric

806  
00:34:57,470 --> 00:34:55,050  
loss and unless we know those two we

807  
00:35:00,230 --> 00:34:57,480  
don't necessarily know what the original

808  
00:35:02,000 --> 00:35:00,240  
supply was because one is still in the

809  
00:35:07,310 --> 00:35:02,010  
system hard to know the bulk earth and

810  
00:35:09,650 --> 00:35:07,320  
the other is lost yeah thanks that

811  
00:35:11,600 --> 00:35:09,660  
really beautiful talk I just maybe

812  
00:35:12,740 --> 00:35:11,610  
there's a little bit outside of what

813  
00:35:16,730 --> 00:35:12,750

you're comfortable with but could you

814

00:35:17,620 --> 00:35:16,740

give us your best estimate of scenarios

815

00:35:19,269 --> 00:35:17,630

for the atmosphere

816

00:35:21,490 --> 00:35:19,279

of the earth between three point eight

817

00:35:23,700 --> 00:35:21,500

and four billion years ago yeah that is

818

00:35:26,740 --> 00:35:23,710

outside of what I was talking about but

819

00:35:31,240 --> 00:35:26,750

but but one thing that something that I

820

00:35:33,160 --> 00:35:31,250

skipped that I think is there we go that

821

00:35:37,299 --> 00:35:33,170

I think is very interesting is it's

822

00:35:39,099 --> 00:35:37,309

generally assumed just ad hoc that that

823

00:35:42,370 --> 00:35:39,109

the early Earth looked on the like the

824

00:35:43,990 --> 00:35:42,380

earliest earth the magma ocean earth

825

00:35:46,569 --> 00:35:44,000

look like the left hand side of this

826

00:35:48,700 --> 00:35:46,579

diagram which I actually think there's

827

00:35:50,620 --> 00:35:48,710

some inconsistency to that which is that

828

00:35:52,390 --> 00:35:50,630

they have a magma ocean and iron metal

829

00:35:54,999 --> 00:35:52,400

and then the atmosphere ought to be  $\text{CO}_2$

830

00:35:58,480 --> 00:35:55,009

and  $\text{H}_2\text{O}$  right highly reduced quite

831

00:36:00,370 --> 00:35:58,490

oxidized and it's equally plausible that

832

00:36:01,660 --> 00:36:00,380

the early Earth I don't have nitrogen

833

00:36:03,730 --> 00:36:01,670

here but that the early Earth's

834

00:36:09,730 --> 00:36:03,740

atmosphere the very first atmosphere was

835

00:36:11,589 --> 00:36:09,740

reduced  $\text{CO}_2$  to methane and and so on the

836

00:36:14,109 --> 00:36:11,599

density of this atmosphere of course in

837

00:36:15,819 --> 00:36:14,119

the magma ocean stages tens of bars or

838

00:36:18,269 --> 00:36:15,829

hundreds of bars or something like that

839

00:36:20,259 --> 00:36:18,279

Matt cannot have lasted right the

840

00:36:22,210 --> 00:36:20,269

weathering processes and whatever

841

00:36:24,279 --> 00:36:22,220

whatever else must have drawn down most

842

00:36:27,670 --> 00:36:24,289

of the carbon but I would say that the

843

00:36:29,170 --> 00:36:27,680

starting condition would have to be well

844

00:36:30,940 --> 00:36:29,180

no I wouldn't say what have to be could

845

00:36:34,779 --> 00:36:30,950

easily have been something like this and

846

00:36:36,249 --> 00:36:34,789

the transition to what you're talking

847

00:36:37,900 --> 00:36:36,259

about what you think is old but i think

848

00:36:41,859 --> 00:36:37,910

is like hundreds of million years after

849

00:36:43,210 --> 00:36:41,869

this i I think we don't know very much

850

00:36:45,789 --> 00:36:43,220

about and it would it would be

851  
00:36:48,370 --> 00:36:45,799  
interesting to know one thing that we do

852  
00:36:50,620 --> 00:36:48,380  
seem to know is that this is that the

853  
00:36:52,539 --> 00:36:50,630  
rocks on the surface don't reflect this

854  
00:36:54,609 --> 00:36:52,549  
highly reduced condition going all the

855  
00:36:57,220 --> 00:36:54,619  
way back to 3.8 to 4 billion years which

856  
00:36:59,589 --> 00:36:57,230  
is to say that some oxidation process

857  
00:37:02,319 --> 00:36:59,599  
occurred probably hydrogen loss but

858  
00:37:06,069 --> 00:37:02,329  
there are other ideas yeah it seems like

859  
00:37:08,079 --> 00:37:06,079  
I learned a funky it seems like a lot of

860  
00:37:10,120 --> 00:37:08,089  
the processes should be dependent on the

861  
00:37:12,099 --> 00:37:10,130  
size of scientism you know obviously

862  
00:37:14,319 --> 00:37:12,109  
surface area to volume ratio and

863  
00:37:15,730 --> 00:37:14,329

atmospheric loss and differentiation so

864

00:37:18,970 --> 00:37:15,740

nuts wondering if you'd taken that into

865

00:37:20,380 --> 00:37:18,980

account in your calculation oh so you're

866

00:37:26,380 --> 00:37:20,390

talking about the planet or the planet

867

00:37:28,569 --> 00:37:26,390

Esmil yeah we do take that into account

868

00:37:30,940 --> 00:37:28,579

in terms of planets but in terms of

869

00:37:31,630 --> 00:37:30,950

differentiation to planetesimals this is

870

00:37:35,350 --> 00:37:31,640

something that we're

871

00:37:36,760 --> 00:37:35,360

beginning to get to at least in in in my

872

00:37:38,440 --> 00:37:36,770

research with collaborators which is

873

00:37:41,920 --> 00:37:38,450

that the material delivered to the

874

00:37:43,510 --> 00:37:41,930

planet is not largely chondritic

875

00:37:45,550 --> 00:37:43,520

meteorites but it's probably largely

876

00:37:47,980 --> 00:37:45,560

planetesimals that had been processed on

877

00:37:50,170 --> 00:37:47,990

small bodies on 100 kilometer or 300

878

00:37:53,140 --> 00:37:50,180

kilometers size bodies and the

879

00:37:55,840 --> 00:37:53,150

metamorphism that occurs on that the the

880

00:37:57,190 --> 00:37:55,850

maturation if you will of the carbon and

881

00:37:58,840 --> 00:37:57,200

nitrogen in the hydrogen and the

882

00:38:01,690 --> 00:37:58,850

diversity of materials that are

883

00:38:03,070 --> 00:38:01,700

delivered no we're not taking that into

884

00:38:10,030 --> 00:38:03,080

account and that might be a very large

885

00:38:13,870 --> 00:38:10,040

part of the story I have a two brave

886

00:38:15,880 --> 00:38:13,880

question first I like the argument in

887

00:38:19,060 --> 00:38:15,890

the process of forming climbing say the

888

00:38:21,880 --> 00:38:19,070

process of losing volatiles so if we

889

00:38:24,910 --> 00:38:21,890

just focus on the tablet of the

890

00:38:28,900 --> 00:38:24,920

volatiles let's talk about later on

891

00:38:31,120 --> 00:38:28,910

linear of supply so in addition to the

892

00:38:34,540 --> 00:38:31,130

highly eccentric higher things like a

893

00:38:38,920 --> 00:38:34,550

distance in yo leo are there any other

894

00:38:41,560 --> 00:38:38,930

sectors are also of importance to the

895

00:38:46,060 --> 00:38:41,570

temptation of volatiles and these

896

00:38:49,540 --> 00:38:46,070

factors can be also quantifiable and my

897

00:38:51,300 --> 00:38:49,550

second question is you as you mentioned

898

00:38:56,200 --> 00:38:51,310

with the economy of the solar system

899

00:38:58,750 --> 00:38:56,210

from rocky body gasps body and eyes

900

00:39:02,770 --> 00:38:58,760

abilities outer world so I'm wondering

901  
00:39:04,810 --> 00:39:02,780  
if the economy of likeable or universal

902  
00:39:07,750 --> 00:39:04,820  
for our other planet or system of

903  
00:39:09,760 --> 00:39:07,760  
certain clinical system Thanks well I

904  
00:39:12,010 --> 00:39:09,770  
think I know the answer to your second

905  
00:39:15,340 --> 00:39:12,020  
question I'm not sure I know how to

906  
00:39:17,230 --> 00:39:15,350  
respond to your first question of course

907  
00:39:20,140 --> 00:39:17,240  
actually there's a plot that isn't in

908  
00:39:21,490 --> 00:39:20,150  
here of the composition of stars but I

909  
00:39:23,050 --> 00:39:21,500  
think many of you are familiar with it

910  
00:39:25,540 --> 00:39:23,060  
they're more oxygen rich stars and

911  
00:39:27,820 --> 00:39:25,550  
carbon rich stars and that will have a

912  
00:39:31,300 --> 00:39:27,830  
considerable effect on the on the

913  
00:39:33,450 --> 00:39:31,310

volatile chemistry of the of the dust

914

00:39:36,550 --> 00:39:33,460

and the gas around those stars but

915

00:39:37,990 --> 00:39:36,560

certainly so this is the interstellar

916

00:39:40,210 --> 00:39:38,000

medium here certainly in terms of the

917

00:39:43,330 --> 00:39:40,220

absolute abundance of things like carbon

918

00:39:45,580 --> 00:39:43,340

and nitrogen and obviously hydrogen it

919

00:39:46,990 --> 00:39:45,590

is generally true that any solar

920

00:39:51,190 --> 00:39:47,000

system that is making terrestrial

921

00:39:54,130 --> 00:39:51,200

planets must be shedding those elements

922

00:39:55,810 --> 00:39:54,140

in the process whether they shed them in

923

00:39:58,600 --> 00:39:55,820

the same way that our solar system has I

924

00:40:00,790 --> 00:39:58,610

don't know and I'm not sure I know how

925

00:40:04,120 --> 00:40:00,800

to answer your first question you're

926

00:40:05,530 --> 00:40:04,130

asking whether or not in addition to

927

00:40:07,720 --> 00:40:05,540

heliocentric distance there are other

928

00:40:17,260 --> 00:40:07,730

important variables that affect the lost

929

00:40:19,360 --> 00:40:17,270

processes yeah and and was that question

930

00:40:27,340 --> 00:40:19,370

directed at our solar system or more

931

00:40:29,800 --> 00:40:27,350

generally well there's a certain

932

00:40:31,300 --> 00:40:29,810

stochastic aspect to it right so one

933

00:40:33,520 --> 00:40:31,310

thing that's really important to our

934

00:40:35,530 --> 00:40:33,530

planet apparently is the occurrence of

935

00:40:38,650 --> 00:40:35,540

giant impacts or the frequency of giant

936

00:40:41,650 --> 00:40:38,660

impact and so you know a planet like

937

00:40:45,130 --> 00:40:41,660

Mars which is an embryo which didn't

938

00:40:46,690 --> 00:40:45,140

suffer any truly giant impacts would

939

00:40:49,900 --> 00:40:46,700

certainly have a different loss history

940

00:40:51,490 --> 00:40:49,910

than Earth it has a different history

941

00:40:53,640 --> 00:40:51,500

also because of its heliocentric

942

00:40:55,810 --> 00:40:53,650

distance but the difference between

943

00:40:57,970 --> 00:40:55,820

planets that are effectively embryos

944

00:40:59,350 --> 00:40:57,980

that form very quickly you know Mars is

945

00:41:01,600 --> 00:40:59,360

thought to have formed within the first

946

00:41:03,310 --> 00:41:01,610

couple of million years of the solar

947

00:41:04,770 --> 00:41:03,320

system history as opposed to larger

948

00:41:07,780 --> 00:41:04,780

planets which have this more protracted

949

00:41:09,640 --> 00:41:07,790

impact in accretion history like Earth

950

00:41:14,980 --> 00:41:09,650

and Venus that's that's an important

951  
00:41:17,020 --> 00:41:14,990  
difference you said in the beginning of

952  
00:41:19,840 --> 00:41:17,030  
your talk that the tectonics is

953  
00:41:23,350 --> 00:41:19,850  
essential for the renewal of elements

954  
00:41:25,810 --> 00:41:23,360  
yes so what do you think about is it

955  
00:41:27,850 --> 00:41:25,820  
important for the origin of life or the

956  
00:41:29,560 --> 00:41:27,860  
maintenance of life and what about early

957  
00:41:32,140 --> 00:41:29,570  
Earth before bit tectonics and what

958  
00:41:34,900 --> 00:41:32,150  
about math yeah I think I'll let mark

959  
00:41:36,370 --> 00:41:34,910  
answer that tomorrow I i don't think

960  
00:41:38,980 --> 00:41:36,380  
that plate tectonics is essential for

961  
00:41:40,720 --> 00:41:38,990  
the origin of life I don't think it's

962  
00:41:42,850 --> 00:41:40,730  
necessarily important for the

963  
00:41:45,040 --> 00:41:42,860

maintenance of life but I do think it's

964

00:41:46,780 --> 00:41:45,050

important for the maintenance of

965

00:41:51,010 --> 00:41:46,790

habitability and I think the counter

966

00:41:53,220 --> 00:41:51,020

example is Mars if life Mars appears to

967

00:41:57,280 --> 00:41:53,230

have been habitable early in its history

968

00:42:00,479 --> 00:41:57,290

it appears to have what whether or not

969

00:42:03,370 --> 00:42:00,489

it had life I guess I defer to

970

00:42:05,890 --> 00:42:03,380

others about but definitely the

971

00:42:09,209 --> 00:42:05,900

steadiness of our climate and our

972

00:42:12,519 --> 00:42:09,219

habitability is intrinsically limited

973

00:42:14,259 --> 00:42:12,529

intrinsically related to plate tectonics

974

00:42:18,880 --> 00:42:14,269

I would assert but i think that mark is

975

00:42:21,249 --> 00:42:18,890

going to address this tomorrow true all

976

00:42:24,130 --> 00:42:21,259

right thank you great thought a lot to

977

00:42:25,569 --> 00:42:24,140

think about one question is in the near

978

00:42:27,999 --> 00:42:25,579

the end we are talking mentioned there

979

00:42:29,829 --> 00:42:28,009

is a possible late loss of a nitrogen

980

00:42:34,449 --> 00:42:29,839

from low temperature animals here yes

981

00:42:37,449 --> 00:42:34,459

and and I like to hear you to talk more

982

00:42:39,669 --> 00:42:37,459

about that and if that was a case oh

983

00:42:43,599 --> 00:42:39,679

where is that isotopic fractionation

984

00:42:45,370 --> 00:42:43,609

Sigma signature okay so it depends on

985

00:42:47,229 --> 00:42:45,380

the on the light I did I wasn't very

986

00:42:49,269 --> 00:42:47,239

specific about what that late loss was

987

00:42:51,309 --> 00:42:49,279

if the late loss was something like

988

00:42:53,589 --> 00:42:51,319

hydrodynamic escape then there would be

989

00:42:55,059 --> 00:42:53,599

a very strong isotopic signature but it

990

00:42:59,229 --> 00:42:55,069

actually wasn't what I was thinking

991

00:43:03,039 --> 00:42:59,239

about there's a recent paper by slick

992

00:43:04,929 --> 00:43:03,049

ting at all that suggests that not giant

993

00:43:07,929 --> 00:43:04,939

impacts but small impacts are much more

994

00:43:10,150 --> 00:43:07,939

ablative than we previously thought and

995

00:43:14,019 --> 00:43:10,160

and if the loss was by ablation then

996

00:43:15,519 --> 00:43:14,029

first of all we wouldn't expect a that

997

00:43:18,039 --> 00:43:15,529

we wouldn't expect an isotopic

998

00:43:19,299 --> 00:43:18,049

fractionation and second of all then we

999

00:43:20,650 --> 00:43:19,309

need to think about the late veneer

1000

00:43:22,809 --> 00:43:20,660

differently because the whole idea of

1001  
00:43:26,079 --> 00:43:22,819  
the late veneer is is that small impacts

1002  
00:43:27,939 --> 00:43:26,089  
add volatile to the planet but if if if

1003  
00:43:29,620 --> 00:43:27,949  
the ablation is very efficient in some

1004  
00:43:31,599 --> 00:43:29,630  
of those small impacts in some fraction

1005  
00:43:33,880 --> 00:43:31,609  
of the small impact then the late veneer

1006  
00:43:36,549 --> 00:43:33,890  
itself is both in addition and a loss

1007  
00:43:38,829 --> 00:43:36,559  
process and has the possibility of a

1008  
00:43:41,410 --> 00:43:38,839  
fractionation not of isotopes but of

1009  
00:43:42,849 --> 00:43:41,420  
different elements depending on their

1010  
00:43:47,650 --> 00:43:42,859  
persistence in the atmosphere or

1011  
00:43:50,259 --> 00:43:47,660  
deposition and solid okay so we need to

1012  
00:43:52,100 --> 00:43:50,269  
wrap up for lunch we thank the speakers

1013  
00:43:55,320 --> 00:43:52,110

this morning once more

1014

00:44:07,720 --> 00:43:55,330

[Applause]